Increasing Diversity in your Department

Speakers

- **Best Hiring Practices: Addressing Unconscious Bias**
  Caroline Simpson, Florida International University

- **Tools for Recruiting a Diverse Applicant Pool**
  Andrew A. West, Boston University

- **Recruitment and Retention of LGBTIQ Astronomers**
  William Van Dyke Dixon, STScI

- **Getting to Family-Friendly in Your Department**
  Catherine A. Pilachowski, Indiana University
Best Practices in Hiring

- Increasing Diversity in your Department
- Why should you care? (Other than the obvious)
- Increased Excellence
  - Inclusive recruitment and hiring practices broaden the applicant pool, increasing opportunities to find talented people
- Information:
  - University of Michigan ADVANCE program
    - http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance/home
  - Dr. Abigail J Stewart, University of Michigan
Excellence has no gender or race or sexual orientation

Joan Schmelz, AAS 216, 2010
Addressing Unconscious Bias

- **Schemas**: Non-conscious Hypotheses
  - Schemas (expectations or stereotypes) influence our judgments of others (regardless of our own group).
  - All schemas influence group members’ expectations about how they will be judged.
  - We all have them
Schemas: Non-conscious Hypotheses

- allow efficient, if sometimes inaccurate, processing of information.
- often conflict with consciously held or “explicit” attitudes.
- change based on experience/exposure.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Schemas: Non-conscious Hypotheses

- Schemas are widely culturally shared
  - Both men and women hold them about gender.
  - Both whites and people of color hold them about race/ethnicity.
  - People are often not aware of them.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
When do Schemas Result in Unconscious Bias?

- Evaluation of Identical CVs: Gender
  - When evaluating identical application packages, male and female University psychology professors preferred 2:1 to hire “Brian” over “Karen” as an assistant professor.
  - When evaluating a more experienced record (at the point of promotion to tenure), reservations were expressed four times more often when the name was female.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
When do Schemas Result in Unconscious Bias?

Hiring, Assessments, and Salaries: Mothers

- When evaluating identical applications:
  - Evaluators rated mothers as less competent and committed to paid work than nonmothers.
  - Prospective employers called mothers back about half as often as nonmothers.
  - Mothers were less likely to be recommended for hire, promotion, and management, and were offered lower starting salaries than nonmothers.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
When do Schemas Result in Unconscious Bias?

Hiring, Assessments, and Salaries: Fathers

- When evaluating identical applications:
  - Fathers were not disadvantaged in the hiring process.
  - Fathers were seen as more committed to paid work and offered higher starting salaries than nonfathers.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Critical Mass

- Critical mass affects the use of schemas
  - When there are many individuals, we differentiate among them and cannot rely on group-based schemas.
  - In both experimental and field settings, increasing the female share of those being rated increased ratings of female applicants and employees.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
If We Do Not Actively Intervene, The Cycle Reproduces Itself

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
What Can We Do about Unconscious Bias?

- Awareness
- Policies
- Practices
- Accountability

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
What Practices Matter?

- Recruitment of applicant pool
  - Increase representation of low base-rate groups in pool

- How deliberations are completed
  - Decrease ambiguity in criteria
  - Increase/document knowledge of candidates
  - Rely on evidence
  - Avoid use of global judgments

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Recruitment of the Applicant Pool

- Recruit proactively year-round
- Recruit from wider range of institutions
- Recruit specifically for low base-rate groups
- Use of “open searches” (broad vs. narrow job definitions)

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Active Recruiting

- Widen the range of institutions from which you recruit.
- Consider candidates, including women and minorities, who may currently be thriving at less well-ranked institutions. They may be there because of:
  - Early career decisions based on factors other than ranking of institution
  - Past discrimination by top tier institutions
  - Candidate’s own internalization of schemas

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
During Evaluation

- Focus on Multiple Specific Criteria during Evaluation
  - Avoid “global” evaluations
  - Specify evaluations of scholarly productivity, research funding, teaching ability, ability to be a conscientious departmental/university member, fit with the department’s priorities.
  - Weigh judgments that reflect examination of all materials and direct contact with the candidate.

Bauer and Baltes, 2002, Sex Roles 9/10, 465.

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Candidate Evaluation Tool

Please indicate which of the following are true for you (check all that apply):

- ■ Read candidate's CV
- ■ Read candidate's scholarship
- ■ Read candidate's letters of recommendation
- ■ Attended candidate's job talk
- ■ Met with candidate
- ■ Attended lunch or dinner with candidate
- ■ Other (please explain): ________________________________

Please rate the candidate on each of the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential for (Evidence of) scholarly impact</th>
<th>excellent</th>
<th>good</th>
<th>neutral</th>
<th>fair</th>
<th>poor</th>
<th>unable to judge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) research productivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) research funding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) collaboration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fit with department's priorities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to make positive contribution to department’s climate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to attract and supervise graduate students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to teach and supervise undergraduates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to be a conscientious university community member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

www.umich.edu/%7Eadvproj/CandidateEvaluationTool.doc
Letters of Recommendation

- Successful Medical School Faculty Applicants: Differences

Letters for men:
- Longer
- More references to:
  - CV
  - Publications
  - Patients
  - Colleagues

Letters for women:
- Shorter
- More references to personal life
- More “doubt raisers” (hedges, faint praise, and irrelevancies)
  - “It’s amazing how much she’s accomplished.”
  - “It appears her health is stable.”
  - “She is close to my wife.”

Joan Schmelz, AAS 216, 2010
Study of racial diversity in jury deliberations

Compared with all-white juries, diverse juries deliberating about an African American defendant:

- Took longer to discuss the case
- Mentioned more facts
- Made fewer inaccurate statements
- Left fewer inaccurate statements uncorrected
- Discussed more race-related issues

Jury deliberations are analogous to faculty search deliberations

Recommendation:

- Include people who are committed to diversity and excellence.
- Include women and minorities.


Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Active Recruiting and Open Searches Can Help Increase Diversity

The difference achieved by one UMichigan department

Abigail J Stewart, WIA III, 2009
Resources

- University of Michigan ADVANCE Program:
  - http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance/home

- Under **Resources for Deans and Chairs: Toolkit** – includes
  - Handbook for Faculty Searches and Hiring
  - Candidate Evaluation Tool
  - Positive and Problematic Practices in Faculty Recruitment
  - Frequently Asked Questions: Dual Career Issues
  - Guidelines for Writing Letters of Recommendation
  - How to Help New Faculty Settle In: Common Problems and Alternative Solutions
  - Giving and Getting Career Advice: A Guide for Junior and Senior Faculty + Questions to ask and answer guide
  - Support to Department Chairs and Deans in Assessing Individual Salary Equity
  - Frequently Asked Questions: Retention of Science and Engineering Faculty Who Are Women and/or Members of Racial/Ethnic Minorities
  - Support for Assessment and Improvement of Departmental, School or College Climates
  - Creating a Positive Departmental Climate: Principles for Best Practices